

Exploring the spiritual and experiential dimensions of Sharia-compliant hotels in Indonesian halal tourism: A netnographic analysis of TripAdvisor reviews



Azhar Alam ^{1,2,*}, Raditya Sukmana ², Ririn Tri Ratnasari ², Intan Arfiatin ¹, Rashifahunnisa' Mellinia ¹

¹Department of Islamic Economic Laws, Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta, Surakarta, Indonesia

²Department of Islamic Economics, Universitas Airlangga, Surabaya, Indonesia

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received 29 May 2023

Received in revised form

23 September 2023

Accepted 25 September 2023

Keywords:

Sharia-compliant hotels

Halal tourism

Netnographic methodology

Spiritual experiences

Guest feedback

ABSTRACT

Sharia-compliant hotels constitute a pivotal element of Indonesia's burgeoning halal tourism sector. This research employs a netnographic methodology, employing TripAdvisor reviews, to elucidate the spiritual encounters and divergent assessments encountered by visitors to these Sharia hotels. The escalating demand for accommodations adhering to Sharia principles has driven exceptional industry expansion. Nevertheless, there is a noticeable paucity of scholarly investigations into the religious experiences of patrons frequenting such establishments. This netnographic investigation endeavors to discern and provide qualitative insights into the dichotomy of positive and negative reviews, alongside the spiritual dimensions encountered by guests at Sharia hotels within Indonesia. Analyzing a dataset comprising 427 reviews spanning nine Sharia hotels through grounded theory, our findings reveal that 24.35% of patrons perceive these establishments as meticulously designed with subtle religious nuances and Middle Eastern themes. Furthermore, 25.61% of positive reviews accentuate attributes such as cleanliness, orderliness, and comfort, whereas 53.70% of negative reviews underscore deficiencies in facilities. This study acknowledges its limitation concerning the number of Sharia hotels meeting the specified research criteria. Nevertheless, its findings hold considerable significance as a foundation for service enhancements, and it calls for further research elucidating advanced marketing strategies tailored to address guest feedback concerning Islamic hotels.

© 2023 The Authors. Published by IASE. This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>).

1. Introduction

Indonesia has the world's largest Muslim population. Every year the Muslim population in Indonesia increases significantly. With such a large Muslim population, Indonesia has a good potential for developing the Sharia economy. Bank Indonesia stated that in 2015, the number of halal needs reached around IDR 3,000 trillion. This significant development of the Sharia economy has led to a new phenomenon: the halal lifestyle trend, where people carry out their activities based on Islamic religious principles.

Global businesses directly respond to this phenomenon by providing a halal and needs-

oriented lifestyle that is becoming a trend in society. The potential of the Muslim market is very tempting for entrepreneurs in the tourism sector. Indonesia's beautiful natural wealth makes it attractive in various tourism sectors, including lodging and hotel services. Tourism can be a strategic sector that can increase the country's economy and foreign exchange. The government should pay attention to the hotel industry to improve tourist attractions (Purnomo and Adji, 2016). Ramadhani and Mochklas (2019) mentioned that nearly 30% of the worldwide tourist population is pleased to visit famous religious sites for spiritual or cognitive reasons. Spiritual reasons make halal tourism, based on Islamic religious regulations, a tourist attraction.

The growth of Sharia business, one of which occurs in the halal tourism sector. In Indonesia, Sharia-compliant hospitality hotels have become a new trend in the tourism industry (Muthoifin, 2019). In this case, Sharia-compliant hotels are always related to halal tourism (Baharuddin and Hasan, 2018). Sharia-compliant hotels positively contribute

* Corresponding Author.

Email Address: aa123@ums.ac.id (A. Alam)

<https://doi.org/10.21833/ijaas.2023.10.014>

Corresponding author's ORCID profile:

<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0383-7346>

2313-626X/© 2023 The Authors. Published by IASE.

This is an open access article under the CC BY-NC-ND license

(<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>)

to Indonesia's tourism sector by providing convenient facilities for Muslim tourists to carry out their worship even though they are on vacation. Facilities in the form of places of worship must be provided and easily accessible. Restaurants located in tourist areas must serve dishes with halal branding so that they are safe for consumption by Muslims.

Fathoni and Hadi (2020) stated that the halal industry is the current world trend. It is proven that from year to year, the halal sector continues to grow worldwide. Moreover, in Indonesia, most of the population is Muslim, and people know their lives and want to follow Islamic law. This situation is very likely for the development of the Indonesian halal industry. Satriana and Faridah (2018) stated that to develop halal tourism, Indonesia must increase the presence of Sharia-compliant hotels. Tourism and hospitality are closely related. Customers who want to spend their vacation time need accommodation services with the required facilities. Muslim tourists who wish to get facilities following Sharia principles will choose Sharia-compliant hotels as a place to rest. Tourists need accommodation services to make tourism trips in various regions that provide comfort for relaxing.

In the sophisticated era, tourists use an application that becomes a liaison between them and the accommodation in the TripAdvisor application. The application contains reviews of previous consumers who have stayed at Sharia-compliant hotels. Consumers can also book rooms online and obtain information about the facilities and conditions of Sharia-compliant hotels. The reviews in the application are based on the experiences of consumers who have stayed at Sharia-compliant hotels. The senses play an essential role in the human experience, with memories and emotions tied to them. Therefore, the knowledge consumers get is a benchmark for the quality of Sharia-compliant hotels. If the reviews show the positive side of hotel services, prospective Sharia-compliant hotel guests will give them the confidence to stay a few days. The analysis of visitor experience is expected to contribute more advanced competitive strategy for the hotel industry.

Based on the background, this study explored the components contributing to an unforgettable Sharia-compliant hotel experience based on online traveler reviews. The authors collected and analyzed 427 online narratives that discussed unique Sharia-compliant hotel experiences for tourists related to 9 different Sharia-compliant hotels. This study also leverages the growth of online tourism-related communities where consumer reviews are constantly being uploaded.

The previous Islamic hotel studies focus on Sharia compliance aspects and Sharia attributes (Adirestuty, 2019; Alam et al., 2019; Alandri and Verinita, 2019; Auliya, 2020; Fathoni et al., 2021; Maghrifani, 2018; Usman et al., 2019; Usman et al., 2020). Novelty in this study relies on exploring tourist online reviews of Sharia-compliant hotel

guests, which are rarely studied. Online reviews of guests are essential to assess the effects of Sharia-compliant hotel service improvement measures. International researchers utilize netnography frequently. Sharia-compliant hotel guests' experiences with Sharia compliance have yet to be investigated to enhance them.

This study used a netnographic method to examine consumer experience. They usually write reviews after their stay ends. Kozinets (2015) explained that netnography is a method that combines the Internet and ethnography. Therefore, spontaneously generated review content in information sources such as travel blogs and online reviews allows the creation of a more prosperous and deeper information base on tourism and experiences, including dimensions related to the Islamic hotel context. The results of this study are expected to provide benefits for developing knowledge of Islamic economic law. In addition, this study adds scientific insight for readers regarding the experience of Sharia-compliant hotel visitors in Indonesia by using the netnographic method.

2. Literature review

Maghrifani (2018) explored the understanding of the motivations and values of tourists to choose and stay at Sharia Hotels. The study found that three groups of tourists stayed at the Sharia Hotel. In the first group, people are motivated by searching for new experiences and prioritizing freedom and pleasure. In the second group, people are encouraged to maximize benefits and consider the hotel's functional attributes (i.e., price, place, convenience). In the third group, people choose Sharia as a "way of life." They are committed to Sharia principles in all aspects of their daily life.

Usman et al. (2019) found the relevance of Sharia accommodation and Sharia activities influenced by the prevalence of Sharia motivation, positively affecting satisfaction. Adirestuty (2019) examined the relationship between the quality of Islamic hotel services with Muslim Customer Perceived Value (MCPV), customer satisfaction, and return intention of Sharia-compliant hotels. This study shows that the elements of the proposed MCPV model are essential to retaining Muslim customers in the tourism business. The presence of characteristic Islamic values in Sharia-compliant hotels can satisfy Muslim visitors.

Alandri and Verinita (2019) examined the elements of value that consumers perceive in Sharia-compliant hotels. Functional value, Islamic value, price value, practical value, aesthetic value, transaction value, and emotional value are the seven measured variables. The survey found that the seven characteristics used to determine consumers' perceived value were strong, with Islamic values being the strongest. Alam et al. (2019) analyzed the effect of Sharia compliance and customer experience on Muslim tourists visiting Sharia-compliant hotels satisfaction and loyalty. The results showed that

Sharia compliance, friendliness, customer recognition, promise fulfillment, and personalization significantly affected satisfaction. Another result showed that joy proved to have an impact on the loyalty of Muslim tourists visiting Sharia-compliant hotels.

Usman et al. (2020) examined what hotel facilities are the most significant that Sharia-compliant hotels should provide. He also investigated the relationship between the significance of Sharia compliance and Muslim visitors' perception of Sharia-compliant hotel performance. Muslim visitors who value Sharia compliance better perceive Sharia-compliant hotels' services. Muslim travelers who place a higher value on Sharia compliance are more optimistic about their experience at Sharia hotels, which affects their satisfaction. Auliya (2020) took a research sample of 100 respondents who were selected by accidental sampling method. She found that the variable completeness of Sharia attributes and hotel image affected interest in returning to Sharia-compliant hotels. Fathoni et al. (2021) examined the factors customers consider in choosing a hotel that follows Sharia principles in Malang City, Indonesia. The results show that customers consider nine factors in determining a hotel that follows Sharia principles in Malang City, including Sharia-compliant concepts, information, Sharia services, customer acceptance, reference, needs, and experience.

Sharia compliance aspects and Sharia attributes have become an attraction for visitors from Sharia-compliant hotels management (Adirestuty, 2019; Alam et al., 2019; Alandri and Verinita, 2019; Auliya, 2020; Fathoni et al., 2021; Maghrifani, 2018; Usman et al., 2019; Usman et al., 2020). However, there are still disparities in the management and compliance with Sharia principles. Therefore, it is essential to examine the aspects of customer reviews of Sharia-compliant hotels to provide input and maintain attractiveness for visitors. Research that reveals studies that provide much advice to Sharia-compliant hotel managers still needs to be more significant in number.

Many international researchers have carried out the literature on netnography as a study to explore information on hotel customers. Mkono (2013) examined how diners react to restaurant tourism services as reflected in online reviews. This study finds that the attractiveness of cultural products served to tourists demonstrates the authenticity of tourism, which emphasizes the active involvement of tourists in authenticating experiences. Azer and Alexander (2018) showed how consumers participate in negatively valenced influencing behavior (NVIB) in online settings and what motivates them to utilize different types of NVIB. They found that the relationship between five cognitive (service failure, overpricing, fraud) and emotional (disappointment and insecurity) triggers six forms direct (persuade, warn, and support competitors) and indirect (discredit, express regret, and ridicule).

Sthapit (2018) views memorable hotel experiences for tourists using netnography. The components contributing to travelers' unique hotel experiences in Helsinki and Rovaniemi, Finland, were identified by analyzing customer-generated content on TripAdvisor. Jiménez (2019) indicated that improvements to the hotel's website might include modifications based on specific marketing methods and refer to certain regions mentioned in online reviews. Paraskevaidis and Weidenfeld (2019) showed that netnography helps better understand sign consumption and marketing and how visitors assign symbolic meaning to their Titanic Belfast experience. Chapman and Dilmperi (2022) used online community netnography, using the logic that dominates the service and value framework of the luxury hotel customer. Findings revealed that fun/experienced materials resulted in the most engagement. This study supports the value of using an experiential approach to developing a successful content strategy for the online luxury hotel visitor community.

Marinho et al. (2021) found that in a hotel's digital marketing strategy, the usability and promotion criteria scored the highest out of the five categories studied, followed by customer interaction and point of sale, pricing, and product. Shin and Perdue (2021) conducted a study to understand the online engagement behavior of hotel customers. Netnographic results show that hotel customer engagement behavior creates five types of value. Significantly, these values add up to varying degrees, not only for the customer but also for other customers and the company. Wang et al. (2020) used in-depth netnographic techniques to determine the motives of independent Chinese travelers when choosing hotels. The study found that an attractive environment, quality, uniqueness, spiritual well-being, traditional architecture, family togetherness, foreign style offerings and services, luxury facilities, and entertainment are some of the motives of tourists-modern Chinese culture-focused motivation.

Sthapit and Björk (2020) used netnography to investigate specific value dimensions that produce value outcomes resulting from value interaction (IVF) – shared value, value destruction, and shared value without creation. TripAdvisor user-generated material has been reviewed. Data were analyzed using the grounded theory technique. Findings were based on only one value dimension: hotel breakfast, which yielded all three value outcomes. Ajanovic and Çizel (2020) understand the structure, features, and functions of attitudes expressed in guest evaluations to test communication on hotel review platforms from the point of view of social psychology.

Religious experience is one of the goals to be achieved by tourists who engage in religious tourism (Ruttanavisanon and Agmapisarn, 2022). Religion is considered to be one of the primary motivators of a cross-country traveler (Kamath et al., 2023). Although the definition of religious experience is extensive, the carefully planned distribution of objects in religious spaces and the appearance of

religious objects in holy places are essential in enhancing religious experience (Terzidou, 2020). Visitors seeking a religious experience appreciate the sacred atmosphere that facilitates their religious acts and worship, such as penance, confession, or repentance (Singh et al., 2023). In the context of the religious experiences of Sharia-compliant hotels, this study categorizes worship activities supported by services provided, such as worship equipment, prayer time reminders, and other religious worship facilities.

The previous study on Islamic hotels was dominated by a quantitative approach to examine the effect of certain variables on visitor behavior. Only a few studies used a qualitative approach to determine visitor motives. Few studies have investigated the experience of Sharia-compliant hotel visitors from online reviews. A survey of online reviews of Sharia-compliant hotel visitors is fundamental to get the implications of policies for improving and improving Sharia-compliant hotel services. The use of netnography methods is quite a lot done by international researchers. However, few studies use ethnographic methods to reveal visitor experiences after staying at Sharia-compliant hotels. The adventures of Sharia-compliant hotel visitors regarding the aspect of fulfilling Sharia compliance have yet to be studied in more depth to get input and improvements as reflected in the online reviews of visitors.

This study wants to use the netnographic method by utilizing visitor reviews on sites on the web/internet. This study aims to determine visitor satisfaction when staying at Sharia-compliant hotels through online review analysis such as the Internet by taking case studies of several Sharia-compliant hotels in Indonesia.

3. Methodology

This study aimed to explore what components or narrative forms contribute to describing the experiences of Sharia-compliant hotel visitors in Indonesia. This study used a netnographic data collection method developed by Kozinets (2010), a particular type of ethnography appropriate to the state of the social world mediated by today's computer tools. More clearly, Kozinets (2015) defined netnography as a collection of attitudes and research practices that explore historical trajectories, networks of theoretical conceptions, and networks of citations that are specific performances of cultural studies followed by certain types of representations of understanding. Therefore netnography can be simplified as an adaptation of the ancient method of ethnography to understand what it means to be human with technology (Kozinets and Gambetti, 2020). In tourism studies, netnography is a new adaptation of traditional ethnographic research methods by making the Internet a site for virtual fieldwork (Mkono, 2012). Netnography is considered one of the appropriate methods for this research because it is relatively fast,

simple, and inexpensive. In addition, netnographic analysis allows visitors' experiences, perspectives, and reflections and captures online information about tourism (Mkono and Markwell, 2014).

Although netnography belongs to a new methodology or conceptual renewal of ethnography, the usefulness of netnography in gaining an insider's perspective on a particular culture or online phenomenon has been tested in many areas of tourism research (Mkono, 2012; Volo, 2010; Wu and Pearce, 2014). Moreover, there has been an increase in the number of ethnographic studies published in reputable journals in the field of tourism (Björk and Kauppinen-Räsänen, 2012; Dwivedi, 2009; Power, 2022). Researchers have described Netnography as having advantages in terms of relatively fast, simple, and affordable access. Netnography is also considered capable of providing easy access to the real experiences of visitors based on their perspectives and reflections and capturing the exchange of tourism information on the Internet (Mkono, 2012; Mkono and Markwell, 2014; Wu and Pearce, 2014).

The object of this study was the experience and religious side that Sharia-compliant hotel visitors feel. The object of this study was to reveal what visitors note when using Sharia-compliant hotel services. This study's subject was an online review written by Sharia-compliant hotel visitors on a popular tourist site, TripAdvisor. Considering the large amount of data about online reviews, this study limits it to a particular scope described in the data types and collection section.

3.1. Procedures and data collection

This study adopted netnography in the form of observations or non-participant observations in data collection. It was based on online reviews published on Tripadvisor about tourists' experiences when visiting Sharia-compliant hotels in Indonesia.

Kozinets (2010) emphasized that the pure netnographic method already represents what ethnography does offline because it includes complete elements as traditional ethnography. In writing the latest netnographic process, significant collection can be achieved from the results of the manifestation of data shared on the Internet that can be accessed widely and freely (Kozinets, 2015).

Data collection from online tour reviews, travel message boards, and other virtual tourism internet media, including chat forums and social networking sites, can be used as data sources and analyzed thematically (Catterall and Maclaran, 2001). Thus, the reviews posted by Sharia-compliant hotel visitors contain rich insights and information about their experience in visiting (Mauri and Minazzi, 2013; Zhou et al., 2014) and become a valuable and credible data source (Rahmadian et al., 2022; Yoo and Gretzel, 2012).

There were many considerations when choosing TripAdvisor as the primary data source. Academic researchers in the travel industry are increasingly

attracted to sites like TripAdvisor for their simplicity of use (Boyd and Ellison, 2007) and the potential to gain millions of customer insights and views (Sangkaew and Zhu, 2022). The TripAdvisor site also has efforts to combat the circulation of fake reviews on the Internet and has several procedures to screen all online reviews.

TripAdvisor was chosen as one of the premier travel community sites for customer-to-customer communication due to its many communities and possible search criteria. With more than 50 million unique monthly visits and 60 million reviews, this free travel guide supports users in obtaining travel and destination information and provides a forum for consumer comments, recommendations, and warnings (Sthapit, 2018; Sthapit and Björk, 2020).

3.2. Data analysis

Several other studies have used thematic analysis to analyze online narratives (Mkono, 2013), cluster analysis (Tussyadiah and Zach, 2017), and grounded theory (Björk and Kauppinen-Räsänen, 2012; Zhang and Hitchcock, 2017). In the context of this study, the grounded theory design described by Glaser and Strauss (2006) was used to analyze the collected data. This study used netnographic data collection techniques, as Mkono and Markwell (2014) mentioned, in other terms, online ethnography or virtual ethnography. This study used the grounded theory that Glaser and Strauss (2006) formulated to analyze data. Many qualitative research experts have combined ethnography and grounded theory in a research study. Ethnography and grounded theory can be a combination and methodological complement in a study (Glaser and Strauss, 2006; Hammersley and Atkinson, 2019). Combining ethnography and grounded theory can share the constructivist principle that truth and reality are related to individual perceptions (FitzGerald and Mills, 2022). Although some practical mechanisms of each research methodology may differ, they form a powerful and effective strategy when combined (FitzGerald and Mills, 2022). Grounded theory and ethnography, as explained by FitzGerald and Mills (2022), have compatibility, although some elements have similarities and differences. Grounded theory can formalize and extend the limited theoretical components of ethnography (FitzGerald and Mills, 2022).

3.3. Research steps

The steps in netnographic studies on visitors' experiences of these Sharia-compliant hotels follow what Kozinets (2002) provide. The first step is to determine the data source from the online community that is most relevant to the interest of this study, namely TripAdvisor. This site has many criteria described in Kozinets (2010), including relevance, liveliness, interaction, actuality, heterogeneity, and more data. The collection of data sources is the second step in this study. Data

collection and analysis were carried out between 2018 and 2022. A total of 9 hotels were selected selectively based on the rating and the activeness of the number of online reviews or reviews available.

Keywords such as good reviews as a reflection of excellent or pleasant experiences felt by Sharia-compliant hotel visitors are grouped and investigated, such as Sharia-compliant, good, comfortable, positive, good, great, and delicious. In addition, keywords that describe the negative side of the visiting experience, such as not according to Sharia, harmful, unpleasant, and uncomfortable, represent a reflection of the negative experiences of Sharia-compliant hotel visitors.

When the reviews are done according to the expectations and personal goals of the visitors, then the visitors will experience positive feelings. On the other hand, if visitors do not get the experience to match their expectations, it generates negative feelings (Zhou and Li, 2023). Several keywords are used as constraints to address relatively large data sources. Irrelevant reviews will be omitted from the analysis to ensure analytical depth and focus.

The third step is related to ethics and the role of researchers in treating data. Wu and Pearce (2014) stated that if the researcher positions himself as an observer who doubles as a participant, it is necessary to reveal his identity and motives and conduct investigations on the main informant. On the other hand, if the researcher is not in the position of an observer who is also a participant, then there is no need for prior identification or approval because public information on the Internet is sometimes sent anonymously and has been posted in the past (Mkono, 2012).

The third step also includes data analysis with a grounded theory approach. This study used a passive system, and the researcher is confidential by not interfering with the research subject's naturally occurring or ongoing discussions. The covert netnographic approach adopted here supports a high personal and social distance between researchers and bloggers. In the context of this study, the grounded theory design belongs to Glaser and Strauss (2006) used to analyze the collected data. The collected data is scanned for broad understanding. This step was followed by reading the online narrative and categorizing the value dimensions, which yielded three different results. In the last step, part of the interpretation and coding refers to done manually by Corbin and Strauss (2008). This study used triangulation of data sources by randomly interviewing several people who write reviews or online reviews on TripAdvisor about Sharia-compliant hotels. In addition to maintaining the coding process's consistency, clarity, and objectivity, this study involves more than one researcher (Thomas, 2006). The involvement of more than one researcher ensures the coding process's reliability, which is very important in the netnographic method, given a large amount of data to be analyzed, coded, and sorted into themes.

Throughout the coding process, there are continuous revisions and refinements of the coding system, finding subcodes and identifying conflicting points of view in the coding process.

4. Findings

This study coded the review of visitors of Sharia-compliant hotels in Indonesia with restrictions through hotel rating criteria of at least three stars and a review rating of at least four stars. The authors classified 9 Sharia-compliant hotels in Indonesia as objects of ethnographic study. From 427 reviews, the authors ranked them into three reviews, namely religious reviews, positive reviews, and negative reviews. This classification facilitates this study

regarding the experiences felt by Sharia-compliant hotel visitors.

First, the authors present data on religious reviews, as in Table 1. The design of religious nuances and Middle Eastern themes show the highest percentage, 24.35%. The hotel also provides a place for prayers, such as close to the mosque and the presence of a prayer room, with a rate of 20.78%. Halal and Middle Eastern food with a percentage of 18.18%, religious voice speakers both holy books, Islamic music, and again with a rate of 17.85%, Worship facilities include a place for ablution, prayer tools, and Quran with a percentage of 14.94%, and the lowest percentage is Sharia-based services with 3.90%.

Table 1: religious reviews of Sharia-compliant hotels visitors

Code	Percentage	Indicative quotes
Middle Eastern theme and religious design	24.35%	This Sharia-compliant hotel is Islamic, comfortable, and beautiful with an elegant Middle Eastern-style interior Middle Eastern theme with Islamic nuance is cool
Congregational prayer (Near the mosque and prayer room)	20.78%	Every floor has a prayer room; if you want to pray in the congregation, you can go to the prayer room on the 1st floor Middle Eastern themed, the location is close to the Al-Akbar Mosque, so you can congregare there
Halal and Middle Eastern food	18.18%	The food is halal guaranteed with MUI (Indonesian Ulema Council) certificate Good choice of food, with Arabic menus such as biryani rice with mutton, recommended especially coming with family "You can hear the chanting of the Quran in the lobby and room
Religious voice speaker (Holy Bible, Islamic music, and Adhan)	17.85%	Many impressions about this Sharia-compliant hotel. From the speakers in the room and lobby, there is always the chanting of the holy verses of the Quran, sometimes alternating with <i>tausiah</i> (Islamic lecturing)
Worship facilities include ablution, prayer tools, and the Quran	14.94%	Equipped with Sharia facilities that help hotel guests to stay without fear of missing out on worship There is prayer equipment that makes me quite calm too Waiters wear syar'i and polite clothes
Service with Sharia principles	3.90%	Greeted with Assalamualaikum, a different characteristic from the other hotels

The highest percentage is in the code of religious nuances design and Middle Eastern themes. For example, the following review: "The theme of the Middle East with Islamic nuances is cool." Reviews that visitors mention, such as "design," "feel," and "theme," are frequently identified words in studies in this code. The lowest percentage is that the services applied by Sharia-compliant hotels are also following Sharia. For example, "waiters use Islamic and polite clothes" and "welcome greeting with Assalamualaikum." In addition to discussing reviews of religious experiences, the study also provides annotations to positive reviews of Sharia-compliant hotel visitors, as shown in Table 2. Positive reviews indicate visitor satisfaction after staying at Sharia-compliant hotels. Cleanliness, tidiness, and comfort occupy the highest percentage, 25.61%. Good service and health protocols with a rate of 21.77%. Facilities: spacious and nice rooms, satisfying facilities, interior, swimming pool, Azan and Quran speakers, ample parking, beautiful rooftop with 14.74%. Varied and delicious food with a percentage of 14.65%. Strategic location and beautiful scenery with a rate of 13.26%. Affordable prices with a ratio of 4.26%. The lowest percentage is the concept of Sharia management, with 1.72%. The highest percentage is in the cleanliness, tidiness, and comfort code. The words that visitors often identify are "clean," "tidy," and "comfortable." Like the following reviews: "very safe, comfortable and clean, good sleep because it is far from street noise." Then the

lowest percentage is the concept of Sharia management. Like the following review: "Very happy to see Sharia-compliant hotels with a concept that is still rare like this and inside the hotel, I always find friendliness and a high sense of empathy when it comes." This study also discusses reviews of negative experiences, as shown in Table 3. Negative experiences show visitors' disappointment when staying at Sharia-compliant hotels. Such as inadequate facilities: distance to the swimming pool, narrow parking area, no playground, poor internet connection, little prayer room, and lack of prayer equipment, with the highest percentage of 53.70%. Then the service is not good, uncomfortable, and lacks Sharia implementation with a share of 20.37%. Lack of cleanliness with a rate of 15.43%, food is not tasty with a percentage of 7.41%. The lowest percentage is Unaffordable Prices, 3.09 %.

The highest percentage lies in the unsatisfactory facility code, which should concern Sharia-compliant hotels because they are looking for 53.70%. Reviewers mention the lack of facilities available at Sharia-compliant hotels. Like the review, the following: "The bed is a little bit hard, the slippery floor in the bathroom, best to provide additional rubber mat on the floor, more global TV channels." The lowest percentage on affordable price codes. Even with the lowest rate, the price should be adjusted to the available facilities so that it does not create a high price.

Table 2: Positive reviews of Sharia-compliant hotels visitors

Code	Percentage	Indicative quotes
Cleanliness, tidiness, and comfort	25.61%	All the facilities are clean, from the rooms, toilets, swimming pool, and breakfast room Nice hotel, clean, comfortable Very safe, comfortable, and clean... also good to sleep because it is far from street noise
Good service and health protocol	21.77%	Friendly staff service, and I am pleased It feels very comfortable, and the employees are fast response and friendly if we need something, comply with the health protocol
Facilities: spacious and excellent room, satisfying facilities, interior, swimming pool, Azan and Quran speakers, ample parking, beautiful rooftop	14.74%	Meeting rooms with various types and facilities are quite satisfactory. The services provided follow the wishes of the guests. Complete facilities have always made me happy to visit this Sharia-compliant hotel The rooms and facilities provided are very representative and deserve to be recommended by guests who will visit
Food is varied and delicious	14.65%	The first visit experience feels pretty comfortable, especially for me. Besides, the food here is also delicious and halal guaranteed We found a restaurant with a variation and interesting menu
Strategic location and beautiful view	13.26%	The place is also strategic. Close to highway and airport The hotel is good, guys. The location is also strategic. There is a mini rooftop above and a mini swimming pool. It is perfect for coffee in the morning while looking at the view of the mountains and the cool air
Affordable prices	4.26%	Worth it With this price, I am okay with everything; good crew, good food, clean rooms, rooftop cafes
Sharia Management Concept	1.72%	It is very nice to see Sharia-compliant hotels with a concept that is still rare like this. In addition, inside the hotel, I always find friendliness and a high sense of empathy. I will always make it an option if you stay in the morning

Table 3: Negative reviews of Sharia-compliant hotel visitors

Code	Percentage	Indicative quotes
Unsatisfactory facilities: distance to the swimming pool, parking area, no playground, lousy internet connection, narrow prayer room, lack of prayer equipment	53.70%	Wi-Fi facilities cannot be accessed optimally in every room The bed is a little hard, slippery floor in the bathroom, best to provide additional rubber mat on the floor, more global TV channels There is a motorbike parking that does not have a roof; maybe a roof can be added so that the motorbike does not overheat/rain
Service is not good, not comfortable, and lacks Sharia implementation	20.37%	There is something unfortunate in terms of usage, which is less Sharia, and indeed, if you wear a long skirt, it has all covered, not the middle part on the back The check-in time was quite long because there were rooms that were not ready, even though it was past 2 o'clock In the outdoor area, there are not enough trash cans
Cleanliness	15.43%	Please pay attention to the ballroom area when I was at the event; I saw rats, and in the parking area, please pay attention to cleanliness several times to see rats hanging around
Not good food	7.41%	The taste of the food is very mediocre, and from checking in to checking out, we did not get the promised Zamzam water However, breakfast is a so-so and not good variety
Less affordable Price	3.09%	The price per night is slightly high, but the rooms are good overall. Pretty clean except for the toilet Breakfast is average, but the price is quite high compared to the surrounding hotels

5. Discussion

This study contains three codes categorized from religious, positive, and negative reviews. The thoughts of visitors' spiritual experiences at Sharia-compliant hotels showed satisfactory results. Moreover, the elements in the Sharia-compliant hotels showed their conformity with Sharia principles. Several aspects underlie Sharia-compliant hotels, such as in the discussion of the regulation of the Minister of Tourism and the creative economy, namely products, services, and management according to Sharia principles. The product aspect in question is the provision of accommodation for all groups, both Muslims and non-Muslims, such as food that does not contain elements of pork and alcohol, does not include details of gambling and adultery, and does not contain elements of injustice and ambiguity. As the results of the data obtained, the products provided by Sharia-compliant hotels follow the details in the regulation of the Minister of Tourism and the creative economy with the example that unmarried visitors are not allowed to enter to prevent adultery (pre-marriage sex). The service

aspect of the Sharia-compliant hotels is based on the data obtained according to Sharia principles. Some visitors state that the service at one of the Sharia-compliant hotels uses Sharia clothing and is polite in addition to greetings with "Assalamualaikum." This statement aligns with Maulidya et al. (2019), who stated that the service quality of Sharia-compliant hotels is a form of cognitive evaluation from customers for each service presentation that relies on each activity following moral values explained by Sharia. The management aspect presented by Sharia-compliant hotels based on the data showed that according to Sharia principles, management utilizes materials and facilities obtained by visitors, such as the availability of Islamic designs, prayer tools, places of worship, and chanting the holy verses of the Quran. This finding shows that Sharia-compliant hotel management is based on Sharia values. They are strengthened by the study of Sadiyah (2019), which stated that management is an effort to control and utilize resources, both material and facilities, to achieve the desired goals.

The reviews of positive experiences of Sharia-compliant hotel visitors in Indonesia showed that

most of them reaped satisfaction with visitors. Visitor satisfaction is the primary key to retaining customers, so it is only possible to survive with Sharia-compliant hotels' satisfaction. The experience visitors get a memory, so what visitors review in the TripAdvisor application is based on their knowledge while visiting. According to the study by [Hosany et al. \(2022\)](#), when we do activities, think, and reason, we primarily use facts from memory gained through experience. Therefore, maintaining visitor satisfaction is essential, for example, cleanliness, tidiness, service, facilities, dishes, and prices.

Sharia-compliant hotels must also have housekeeping who are fully responsible for the cleanliness and comfort of the entire hotel area. Hotel housekeeping plays a vital role in hotel services, not only in the room area but also in the building and its facilities. In addition, visitor satisfaction also depends on the communication of the people who play a role in coordinating serving visitors. Sharia-compliant hotels also provide facilities that help visitors feel comfortable, such as the study by [Andesta \(2019\)](#), who said that the facilities offered by Sharia-compliant hotels significantly affect the assessment of visitors and maintain the image or good name of Sharia-compliant hotels. Although from the data obtained, there were some unsatisfactory facilities, most of the facilities followed visitor satisfaction. Generally, the price per night for Sharia-compliant hotels follows the facilities visitors get. However, there are some hotels that, according to visitors, still need to be more expensive. This expense must be considered because the price is the main attraction for potential visitors, especially with discounts and promos being an attractive marketing idea for Sharia-compliant hotels.

Finally, the authors reviewed the negative experiences of visitors to Sharia-compliant hotels in Indonesia. Unfavorable reviews show disappointment when staying at Sharia-compliant hotels. The data shows that only a few reviews express disappointment with Sharia-compliant hotels compared to religious and positive reviews. However, this needs to be considered by the hotel management to improve the quality of Sharia-compliant hotels. According to the study by [Pramudita et al. \(2022\)](#), the relationship between customer satisfaction and customer loyalty is that if the business entity increases customer satisfaction, the customer will also have high fidelity to how to increase visitor satisfaction by repairing inadequate facilities because facilities are the main problem for Sharia-compliant hotels. According to [Permadi and Muttaqillah \(2021\)](#), facilities that must be available at Sharia-compliant hotels are worship facilities that are suitable for use, facilities that must be easily accessible, and facilities that must meet Sharia principles. Based on this study, Sharia-compliant hotels must be able to complete the three mandatory points. In addition to disappointment dominating the facilities, service, cleanliness, dishes, and prices are also problems for some Sharia-compliant hotels.

Even with a small percentage, these problems must be resolved immediately. In services at Sharia-compliant hotels, the data showed fewer Sharia servers. This finding contradicts the study of [Fransisca and Purnomo \(2019\)](#), which stated that a Muslim makes modesty in a dress a factor of religious attributes in halal tourism. The authors also obtained data on several Sharia-compliant hotels that lacked cleanliness and dishes that were not tasty but still halal, according to the study of [Rasit et al. \(2016\)](#), not only from the aspect of halal food but also from the aspect of cleanliness. Because cleanliness is part of a faith-based on Sharia, Sharia-compliant hotels should highlight their cleanliness to improve their Sharia image.

6. Conclusion

This study explored three components contributing to the Sharia-compliant hotel experience in Indonesia: religious knowledge, positive experience, and negative experience. Based on our findings, first, most Sharia-compliant hotels show Islamic identity with their respective concepts, especially the design of religious nuances and Middle Eastern themes. In addition, several facilities regarding the availability of prayer rooms, halal food, chanting of the holy book, prayer equipment, and services following the Shari'a also strengthen the identity of Sharia-compliant hotels. Second, the findings show a positive experience as many visitors are satisfied with the service, dominated by its cleanliness, tidiness, and comfort. Cleanliness is the most important, so it has the highest percentage of satisfaction. Third, the findings showed the negative experiences of Sharia compliance as hotel visitors expressed their disappointment, especially at the hotel's inadequate facilities. Unlike Sharia-compliant hotel studies focusing on conceptualizing Islamic attributes and travelers' behavioral intentions, this study examines what visitors review on TripAdvisor. It classifies them in terms of religious experience, and positive and negative experiences. The results of this study imply that the religious experience of Sharia-compliant hotels is essential: the hotel must pay more attention to the Sharia concept, which attracts visitors. In addition, many visitors express their positive experiences, which are dominated by its cleanliness, tidiness, and comfort. However, the management of Sharia-compliant hotels needs to provide adequate service facilities for visitors so that Sharia-compliant hotels can compete with conventional hotels. Facilities that must be available in Sharia-compliant hotels are worship facilities that are suitable for use, facilities that must be easily accessible, and facilities that must meet Sharia principles. In terms of limitations, first, this study is limited to 9 Sharia-compliant hotels with selected criteria. This study analyzes the content of Sharia-compliant hotel visitor reviews posted only on the TripAdvisor application. However, this study is a pioneering study that examines reviews of Sharia hotel visitors on TripAdvisor and can be a reference

for developing Sharia-compliant hotel services. Future studies should analyze other travel websites like Agoda or Traveloka and other reputable tourism review applications. Future studies should focus more on visitor experience with a broad meaning.

Compliance with ethical standards

Conflict of interest

The author(s) declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

References

- Adirestuty F (2019). Customer-perceived value in creating customer satisfaction and revisit intention in Sharia hotels. *Journal of Islamic Monetary Economics and Finance*, 5(2): 367-386. <https://doi.org/10.21098/jimf.v5i2.1067>
- Ajanovic E and Çizel B (2020). Deconstructing persuasiveness of online hotel review platforms. *Tourism Analysis*, 25(2-3): 319-333. <https://doi.org/10.3727/108354220X15758301241828>
- Alam MN, Nurzaman MS, and Al Hasan FA (2019). The influence of Sharia compliance and customer experience on satisfaction and loyalty of Muslim tourist who visited Sharia hotel. In the 2018 International Conference on Islamic Economics and Business, Atlantis Press, Malang, Indonesia: 57-63. <https://doi.org/10.2991/iconies-18.2019.11>
- Alandri SK and Verinita V (2019). Sharia hotel concept and customer value effect on customer satisfaction. *Integrated Journal of Business and Economics*, 3(2): 207-219. <https://doi.org/10.33019/ijbe.v3i2.175>
- Andesta W (2019). Pengaruh fasilitas terhadap kepuasan tamu menginap di hannah hotel syariah painan. *Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Keluarga*, 11(1): 68-71. <https://doi.org/10.24036/jpk/vol11-iss1/582>
- Auliya ZF (2020). Factors affecting interest in revisiting Sharia hotel. *Jurnal Al-Qardh*, 4(2): 76-87. <https://doi.org/10.23971/jaq.v4i2.1552>
- Azer J and Alexander MJ (2018). Conceptualizing negatively valenced influencing behavior: Forms and triggers. *Journal of Service Management*, 29(3): 468-490. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJOSM-12-2016-0326>
- Baharuddin AZ and Al Hasan FA (2018). Perkembangan bisnis hotel Syariah di Indonesia (Studi Kasus Pengembangan Hotel Syariah di Lombok Provinsi Nusa Tenggara Barat). *Al-'Adl*, 11(1): 33-52.
- Björk P and Kauppinen-Räsänen H (2012). A netnographic examination of travelers' online discussions of risks. *Tourism Management Perspectives*, 2: 65-71. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2012.03.003>
- Boyd DM and Ellison NB (2007). Social network sites: Definition, history, and scholarship. *Journal of computer-mediated Communication*, 13(1): 210-230. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1083-6101.2007.00393.x>
- Catterall M and Maclaran P (2001). Body talk: Questioning the assumptions in cognitive age. *Psychology and Marketing*, 18(10): 1117-1133. <https://doi.org/10.1002/mar.1046>
- Chapman A and Dilmeri A (2022). Luxury brand value creation with online brand communities in the service encounter. *Journal of Business Research*, 144: 902-921. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2022.01.068>
- Corbin J and Strauss A (2008). Strategies for qualitative data analysis. *Basics of Qualitative Research: Techniques and Procedures for Developing Grounded Theory*, 3 (10): 4135. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781452230153>
- Dwivedi M (2009). Online destination image of India: A consumer based perspective. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 21(2): 226-232. <https://doi.org/10.1108/09596110910935714>
- Fathoni M, Soetjipto BE, and Handayati P (2021). Customer awareness of Shariah compliant hotels (Study on Hotel Customers in Malang). *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*, 8(12): 522-532. <https://doi.org/10.18415/ijmmu.v8i12.3293>
- Fathoni MA and Hadi ST (2020). Portrait of the Indonesian Halal industry: Opportunities and challenges. *Scientific Journal of Islamic Economics*, 6(3): 428-435.
- FitzGerald J and Mills J (2022). The importance of ethnographic observation in grounded theory research. *Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 22(2). <https://doi.org/10.17169/fqs-22.2.3840>
- Fransisca Y and Purnomo AK (2019). The factors affecting the purchasing decision of the Millennial Muslim generation. *Management, Business, and Accounting (MBIA)*, 18(2): 1-20. <https://doi.org/10.33557/mbia.v18i2.349>
- Glaser B and Strauss A (2017). *Discovery of grounded theory: Strategies for qualitative research*. Routledge, Abingdon, UK. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203793206>
- Hammersley M and Atkinson P (2019). *Ethnography: Principles in practice*. Routledge, Abingdon, UK. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315146027>
- Hosany S, Sthapit E, and Björk P (2022). Memorable tourism experience: A review and research agenda. *Psychology and Marketing*, 39(8): 1467-1486. <https://doi.org/10.1002/mar.21665>
- Jiménez FS (2019). How hotel websites may discursively adjust to customer preferences using online criticism. *IBÉRICA*, (38): 203-226.
- Kamath V, Ribeiro MA, Woosnam KM, Mallya J, and Kamath G (2023). Determinants of visitors' loyalty to religious sacred event places: A multigroup measurement invariance model. *Journal of Travel Research*, 62(1): 176-196. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00472875211057600>
- Karim MHA, Ahmad R, and Zainol NA (2017). Differences in hotel attributes: Islamic hotel and Sharia compliant hotel in Malaysia. *Journal of Global Business and Social Entrepreneurship (GBSE)*, 1(2): 157-169.
- Kozinets RV (2002). The field behind the screen: Using netnography for marketing research in online communities. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 39(1): 61-72. <https://doi.org/10.1509/jmkr.39.1.61.18935>
- Kozinets RV (2010). *Netnography: Ethnographic research online*. SAGE Publications Limited, London, UK.
- Kozinets RV (2015). *Netnography: Redefined*. SAGE Publications Limited, London, UK. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118767771.wbiedcs067>
- Kozinets RV and Gambetti R (2020). *Netnography unlimited: Understanding technoculture using qualitative social media research*. Routledge, New York, USA. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003001430>
- Maghrifani D (2018). Emerging Sharia hotel in Indonesia: Understanding the tourists' motivation and values. *International Journal of Business and Society*, 19(S4): 661-675.
- Marinho J, Almeida S, and Neto C (2021). Exploration of 3 W's of web marketing in the hotel sector—a study conducted at the Casa da Calçada hotel. In *Advanced Research in Technologies, Information, Innovation and Sustainability: First International Conference*, Springer International Publishing, La Libertad,

- Ecuador: 724-738.
https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-90241-4_55
- Maulidya RN, Kosim AM, and Devi A (2019). Pengaruh etika bisnis islam dan kualitas pelayanan terhadap kepuasan dan loyalitas pelanggan Hotel Syariah Di Bogor. *Al-Amwal: Jurnal Ekonomi dan Perbankan Syariah*, 11(2): 221-240.
- Mauri AG and Minazzi R (2013). Web reviews influence on expectations and purchasing intentions of hotel potential customers. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 34: 99-107. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhm.2013.02.012>
- Mkono M (2012). Netnographic tourist research: The internet as a virtual fieldwork site. *Tourism Analysis*, 17(4): 553-555. <https://doi.org/10.3727/108354212X13473157390966>
- Mkono M (2013). Using net-based ethnography (Netnography) to understand the staging and marketing of "authentic African" dining experiences to tourists at Victoria Falls. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Research*, 37(2): 184-198. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1096348011425502>
- Mkono M and Markwell K (2014). The application of netnography in tourism studies. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 48: 289-291. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2014.07.005>
- Muthoifin M (2019). Shariah hotel and mission religion in Surakarta Indonesia. *Humanities and Social Sciences Reviews*, 7(4): 973-979. <https://doi.org/10.18510/hssr.2019.74133>
- Paraskevaidis P and Weidenfeld A (2019). Sign consumption and sign promotion in visitor attractions: A netnography of the visitor experience in Titanic Belfast. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 31(4): 1937-1955. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJCHM-07-2018-0543>
- Permadi LA and Muttaqillah WR (2021). Kriteria homestay di desa wisata yang memenuhi prinsip-prinsip wisata halal: Sebuah kajian teori. *Jurnal Magister Manajemen Unram* 10(3): 227-235. <https://doi.org/10.29303/jmm.v10i3.667>
- Power S (2022). Enjoying your beach and cleaning it too: A grounded theory ethnography of enviro-leisure activism. *Journal of Sustainable Tourism*, 30(6): 1438-1457. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09669582.2021.1953037>
- Pramudita DT, Gunawan NF, Ningsih MC, and Adilah R (2022). Determinasi kepuasan pelanggan dan loyalitas pelanggan: Harga dan kualitas produk (Literature Review Manajemen Pemasaran). *Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Dan Ilmu Sosial*, 3(1): 424-436. <https://doi.org/10.38035/jmpis.v3i1.1004>
- Purnomo B and Adji MSU (2016). Strategi mengelola ketidakseimbangan supply and demand pada industri perhotelan di solo raya. *Benefit: Jurnal Manajemen dan Bisnis*, 1(1): 34-44.
- Rahmadian E, Feitosa D, and Zwitter A (2022). A systematic literature review on the use of big data for sustainable tourism. *Current Issues in Tourism*, 25(11): 1711-1730. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13683500.2021.1974358>
- Ramadhani SA and Mochklas M (2019). Effect of destination image and subjective norm on the intention to visit Lombok Island Indonesia as the best world halal tourism destination. *Muhammadiyah International Journal of Economics and Business*, 2(2): 161-169.
- Rasit RM, Hamjah SH, and Mansor SF (2016). Provision of Shariah-compliant hotel services towards Muslim tourism in Malaysia. *Proceedings of BESSH-2016*, 157(7): 14-20.
- Ruttanavanon W and Agmapisarn C (2022). Religious tourism in Thailand-A review of Thai literature from 2012-2021. *Social Science Asia*, 8(1): 12-25.
- Sadiyah HH (2019). Pengelolaan hotel syariah menurut fatwa dsn-mui nomor 108 tahun 2016 tentang pedoman penyelenggaraan pariwisata berdasarkan prinsip syariah (Studi Kasus di Hotel Ratna Syariah Kota Probolinggo). *Jurnal Justisia Ekonomika: Magister Hukum Ekonomi Syariah*, 3(1): 1-23. <https://doi.org/10.30651/justeko.v3i1.2934>
- Sangkaew N and Zhu H (2022). Understanding tourists' experiences at local markets in Phuket: An analysis of TripAdvisor reviews. *Journal of Quality Assurance in Hospitality and Tourism*, 23(1): 89-114. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1528008X.2020.1848747>
- Satriana ED and Faridah HD (2018). Halal tourism: Development, chance and challenge. *Journal of Halal Product and Research*, 1(2): 32-42. <https://doi.org/10.20473/jhpr.vol.1-issue.2.32-43>
- Shin H and Perdue RR (2022). Customer nontransactional value cocreation in an online hotel Brand community: Driving motivation, engagement behavior, and value beneficiary. *Journal of Travel Research*, 61(5): 1088-1104. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00472875211024752>
- Singh P, Singh AK, Singh AK, and Ansari IA (2023). What shapes visitor experience at religious destinations? Deploying a systematic review to identify visitor experience constructs. *International Journal of Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage*, 11(1): 8-11.
- Sthapit E (2018). A netnographic examination of tourists' memorable hotel experiences. *Anatolia*, 29(1): 108-128. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13032917.2017.1402190>
- Sthapit E and Björk P (2020). Towards a better understanding of interactive value formation: Three value outcomes perspective. *Current Issues in Tourism*, 23(6): 693-706. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13683500.2018.1520821>
- Terzidou M (2020). Re-materialising the religious tourism experience: A post-human perspective. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 83: 102924. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2020.102924>
- Thomas DR (2006). A general inductive approach for analyzing qualitative evaluation data. *American Journal of Evaluation*, 27(2): 237-246. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1098214005283748>
- Tussyadiah IP and Zach F (2017). Identifying salient attributes of peer-to-peer accommodation experience. *Journal of Travel and Tourism Marketing*, 34(5): 636-652. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10548408.2016.1209153>
- Usman H, Sobari N, and Al Hasan FA (2020). The impact of Sharia compliance on Sharia hotel services and customers satisfaction. *The East Asian Journal of Business Management*, 10(3): 5-12. <https://doi.org/10.13106/jbees.2020.vol10.no3.5>
- Usman H, Sobari N, and Sari LE (2019). Sharia motivation in Muslim tourism definition, is it matter? *Journal of Islamic Marketing*, 10(3): 709-723. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JIMA-01-2018-0015>
- Volo S (2010). Bloggers' reported tourist experiences: Their utility as a tourism data source and their effect on prospective tourists. *Journal of Vacation Marketing*, 16(4): 297-311. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1356766710380884>
- Wang W, Ying S, Mejia C, Wang Y, Qi X, and Chan JH (2020). Independent travelers' niche hotel booking motivations: The emergence of a hybrid cultural society. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 89: 102573. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhm.2020.102573>
- Wu MY and Pearce PL (2014). Appraising netnography: Towards insights about new markets in the digital tourist era. *Current Issues in Tourism*, 17(5): 463-474. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13683500.2013.833179>
- Yoo KH and Gretzel U (2012). Use and creation of social media by travelers. In: Evangelos C (Ed.), *Social media in travel, tourism and hospitality: Theory, practice, and cases*: 189-205. Routledge, Abingdon, UK.
- Zhang Y and Hitchcock MJ (2017). The Chinese female tourist gaze: A netnography of young women's blogs on Macao. *Current Issues in Tourism*, 20(3): 315-330. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13683500.2014.904845>

Zhou L, Ye S, Pearce PL, and Wu MY (2014). Refreshing hotel satisfaction studies by reconfiguring customer review data. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 38: 1-10.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhm.2013.12.004>

Zhou R and Li S (2023). A study on the persuasive function of metadiscourse in hotel responses to negative reviews on TripAdvisor. *English Language Teaching*, 16(6): 1-55.
<https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v16n6p55>